Developing a coherent system of indicators at regional level
Empowering Sustainable Tourism Decision-Making

Ana Moniche
Turismo y Deporte de Andalucía

UNWTO Fourth meeting of the expert group on measuring the sustainability of tourism
Andalucía Lab, Marbella, Spain
19-20 September 2023
The UNWTO Statistical Framework for Measuring the Sustainability of as a fundamental tool Developing a coherent system of indicators at regional level

Enables systematic evaluation of tourism activities and impacts, ensuring consistent performance assessment across diverse sectors and destinations

The document recognizes SF-MST as the foundation for identifying and evaluating opportunities to utilize innovative data sources

Sustainable tourism is a continuous process, and its measurement requires ongoing improvement
1. Identification of key policy themes

2. Primary ambition: to provide information supporting decision making

3. Data and indicators relevant in the medium and long term but need for continuous improvement in measurement practices.

4. Acknowledge of substantial and growing demand for the establishment of such a core set of indicators

5. UNWTO INSTO initiative
## The Significance of Proposed Sustainable Tourism Indicators

### IDENTIFICATION OF STATISTICAL DOMAINS

1. Visitor flows  
2. Visitor expenditure  
3. Visitor satisfaction  
4. Tourism economic activity  
5. Accommodation statistics  
6. Tourism employment and earnings  
7. Tourism business statistics  
8. Tourism investment and infrastructure

9. Government finance statistics  
10. Water resources and flows  
11. Energy and GHG emissions  
12. Waste  
13. Ecosystems  
14. Tourism governance and planning  
15. Host community perceptions
Spain Tourism TSI Project: Support to Spain’s tourism ecosystem: towards a more sustainable, resilient and digital tourism

Regions: How to align with essential priorities such as the Tourism Transition Pathways, EU Green Deal, the EU Climate Law, the Sustainable Development Goals?

Difficulties to implement a system of indicators for implementing policies for sustainable tourism related with: tools, data, actors and resources
Spain Tourism TSI Project: Support to Spain’s tourism ecosystem: towards a more sustainable, resilient and digital tourism

European Commission (DG Reform) / OECD technical assistance:

Assisting Andalusia, Catalonia, Navarra and Valencia to develop and pilot a system of indicators to measure and monitor the sustainability of tourism.

Develop a tool allowing to benchmark between destinations and compare progress.

Help to the process to transform DMOs into data-oriented organisations following sustainable development values.

Contribute to the sustainable and resilient recovery of tourism in Spain.
TSI Actors

• European Commission (DG Reform) / OECD technical assistance
• National Level: Spain Government
• Regional level: Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Sports (Andalusia), Directorate General of Tourism (Catalonia), Directorate of Tourism (Navarra) and Directorate of Tourism (Region of Valencia)
• External actor: Tourism of Tomorrow Lab providing support
Spain Tourism TSI Project: Support to Spain’s tourism ecosystem: towards a more sustainable, resilient and digital tourism

Kick-off meeting and roundtable

Joint, coherent system of indicators for measuring and monitoring the sustainability of tourism at regional level

Draft compilation guide to implement a core set of sustainable tourism indicators

Pilot implementation in selected destinations

Compilation guide to implement a core set of sustainable tourism indicators
Spanish regions tourism sustainability indicator framework: Current thinking on pillars and key policy issues

A. Governance
- Sustainable tourism management
- Sustainable business practices

B. Economic
- Benefits to the local economy
- Reduced seasonality
- Destination attractiveness
- Reduced vulnerability
- Digitalisation

C. Socio-Cultural
- Local community sentiment
- Equal opportunities in tourism
- Accessibility in tourism

D. Environmental
- Climate change mitigation
- Water management
- Protected areas management

S. Supplementary
- Benefits to the local economy
- Reducing tourism pressure
- Increasing security
- Skills development
- Cultural identity
- Waste management
## Spanish regions tourism sustainability indicator framework: Current thinking on indicators

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dimension</th>
<th>Policy issue</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Compilation readiness</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Governance</td>
<td>Sustainable tourism management</td>
<td>A.1 Sustainable tourism development strategy</td>
<td>●</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic</td>
<td>Benefits to the local economy</td>
<td>B.1 Tourism employment</td>
<td>●</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>B.2 Tourism value-added</td>
<td>●</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>B.3 Tourist expenditures</td>
<td>●</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>B.4 Length of stay</td>
<td>●</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>B.5 Bed occupancy</td>
<td>●</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Reduced seasonality</td>
<td>B.6 Tourism seasonality</td>
<td>●</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attraction of tourists</td>
<td>B.7 Tourist satisfaction</td>
<td></td>
<td>●</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reduced vulnerability</td>
<td>B.8 Market dependency</td>
<td></td>
<td>●</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Digitalisation</td>
<td></td>
<td>B.9 Access to online booking</td>
<td>●</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Colour coding for compilation readiness:**
- ● Indicator can be measured as of now (data is available for at least one of the metrics)
- ○ Data sources have been identified, but methodology needs refinement
- ● Data sources still need to be identified
Spanish regions tourism sustainability indicator framework: Current thinking on indicators

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dimension</th>
<th>Policy issue</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Compilation readiness</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Governance</td>
<td>Sustainable tourism management</td>
<td>A.1 Sustainable tourism development strategy</td>
<td>●</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic</td>
<td>Benefits to the local economy</td>
<td>B.1 Tourism employment</td>
<td>●</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>B.2 Tourism value-added</td>
<td>●</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>B.3 Tourist expenditures</td>
<td>●</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>B.4 Length of stay</td>
<td>●</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>B.5 Bed occupancy</td>
<td>●</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>B.6 Tourism seasonality</td>
<td>●</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Attraction of tourists</td>
<td>B.7 Tourist satisfaction</td>
<td>●</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>B.8 Market dependency</td>
<td>●</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Digitalisation</td>
<td>B.9 Access to online booking</td>
<td>●</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Socio-cultural</td>
<td>Local community sentiment</td>
<td>C.1 Population under risk of tourism saturation</td>
<td>●</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equal opportunities in tourism</td>
<td>C.2 Gender equality</td>
<td></td>
<td>●</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C.3 Youth employment</td>
<td></td>
<td>●</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C.4 Job security</td>
<td></td>
<td>●</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accessibility in tourism</td>
<td>C.5 Accessibility in tourism</td>
<td></td>
<td>●</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental</td>
<td>Climate change mitigation</td>
<td>D.1 Public transport modes</td>
<td>●</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D.2 Green mobility infrastructure</td>
<td></td>
<td>●</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D.3 Air travel greenhouse gas emissions</td>
<td></td>
<td>●</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D.4 Tourism-induced greenhouse gas emissions</td>
<td></td>
<td>●</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D.5 Use of renewable energies</td>
<td></td>
<td>●</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sustainable business practices</td>
<td>D.6 Accommodation businesses with relevant and verified sustainability certification</td>
<td></td>
<td>●</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water management</td>
<td>D.7 Tourism water use</td>
<td></td>
<td>●</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D.8 Bathing-water quality</td>
<td></td>
<td>●</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Protected areas management</td>
<td>D.9 Tourism pressure in protected areas</td>
<td></td>
<td>●</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D.10 Monitoring and information systems in natural parks</td>
<td></td>
<td>●</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Colour coding for compilation readiness:
- ● Indicator can be measured as of now (data is available for at least one of the metrics)
- ○ Data sources have been identified, but methodology needs refinement
- ▲ Data sources still need to be identified
Compilation guide with detailed indicator descriptions

- **Short description**

- **Relevance and purpose**

- **Measurement consideration and limitations**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Metrics and units</th>
<th>B.1.</th>
<th>Direct tourism employment as percentage of total employment %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Formula</td>
<td>B.1.</td>
<td>Direct tourism employment / Total employment %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Target direction</td>
<td>Positive: High numbers of employees strengthen the economic development of an economy and contribute to public financing in terms of taxes on earned incomes.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Tourespaña - Social Security Analysis: [https://www.tourespaña.es/es/ConocimientoTuristico/Paginas/Empleo.aspx](https://www.tourespaña.es/es/ConocimientoTuristico/Paginas/Empleo.aspx)
| Recommended frequency | Annually |
| Recommended granularity | Regional |
| Benchmarking and comparability | OECD Structural and Demographic Business Statistics (SDBS): [OECD Structural Business Statistics (SDBS Rev. 4) list](https://www.oecd.org)
TSI's Focus and Impact

- Nationwide endeavor designed to implement EU Reforms
- Bottom-up approach: NUTS2 but local integration
- Policy relevance and coherence other frameworks: European Tourism Dashboard, SF-MST, ...
- Capacity-building exercise, collaborative learning
- Overcome "Analysis paralysis“ and fostering/inspiring policy changes

Joseph Stiglitz:
“What we measure affects what we do and if we measure the wrong thing, we will do the wrong thing“.
TSI's Role and Ambition

- System to evolve into a shared framework
- Interest by many other regions expressed
- Role of NECSTouR Tourism of Tomorrow Lab: future evolution
- UNWTO work, JRC European Tourism Dashboard, OECD scoping paper: response to a growing demand for the establishment of a core set of indicators
Developing a coherent system of indicators at regional level
Empowering Sustainable Tourism Decision-Making

Ana Moniche
Turismo y Deporte de Andalucía

UNWTO Fourth meeting of the expert group on measuring the sustainability of tourism
Andalucía Lab, Marbella, Spain
19-20 September 2023