Creating a destination ‘Risk Register’ informed by indicators through a participatory process-experiences

The Atlantic Sustainable Tourism Observatory, Ireland

Fiona Mckenna
Dr. James Hanrahan
Some questions we were encountering within our indicator systems:

Q. How can DMOs/planners *meaningfully engage* with residents through *indicator frameworks*?

Q. How can we implement a realistic higher level of *citizen participation* in sustainable destination planning?

Q. How to integrate communities into planning processes such as *destination strategies* and *policy instruments* through *indicators*?
Action 1: Creation of a Destination Green Team

Made up of:

- Community representativeness,
- Enterprise owners,
- Geopark (UNESCO) members,
- Local authority
  - Climate Action officer,
  - Environmental officer,
  - Forward planning
  - Tourism Officers
- Tourism groups representatives
- Ecotourism Network
Action 2: Integration of **qualitative insights** within indicator systems to **inform** our quantitative indicator data.

### Resident insights from open text survey questions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>Sub themes</th>
<th>Frequency of issue</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Transport</strong></td>
<td>Concerns about day bus tours</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Public transport issues</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- More park and ride</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Increase local buses</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Train improvement</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Parking concerns</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Traffic management</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Community Involvement and Benefits</strong></td>
<td>Locals finding it difficult to find resident housing</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Needed collaborative approach to tourism planning</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Increased measures to ensure compliance with laws</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Better working conditions in the sector</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Better management of second homes, vacant and derelict properties</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Frustration and non-expectations of survey results</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Not seeing benefit of current tourism model to communities</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Historical lack of feedback or actions on resident concerns</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

References:

1. **0.05% Coverage**
   - Better toilet and parking infrastructure and public transport.
   - Better wages and contracts for staff in tourism facilities, especially restaurants and accommodation.
   - Improved management of cultural and natural sites.

2. **0.05% Coverage**
   - In general, with particular relation to the Burren, it would be fantastic to see a central parking space with electric buses or small electric cars, operating from it for tourists. They would drive back and return the cars.

3. **0.05% Coverage**
   - If there was improved infrastructure, such as sewerage systems and water treatment plants, there would be less of a negative impact from tourism on all residents and tourists during the busiest period of the year (summer). Additionally, developing a year-round tourism offering in the county would help to sustain permanent employment, rather than there being a large increase in available employment for 3 months of the year and then few job opportunities for the remainder of the year.

4. **0.05% Coverage**
   - We need a specially designated cycle track from ennis to north and west Clare. Use an existing road and educate the motorists that they have to share the road with cyclists. The designation of certain routes would help increase tourism.

5. **0.05% Coverage**
   - Greater public transport.
   - Better control of private bus operators and the roads that they use.
   - Better input from businesses in the control of waste generated by them.

6. **0.05% Coverage**
   - A limit should be put on second home ownership especially during a housing crisis.

7. **0.05% Coverage**
   - The Wild Atlantic Way has been an excellent marketing tool to sell the west coast. However, villages/towns not on the route have seen a drop in tourism. This was clearly illustrated in Corofin during the Irish Open in 2019, when for logistics some traffic was directed to go via Corofin, Killenora... and local pub/restaurant owners stated that they saw a huge increase in footfall.
Turning Indicators and Insights into Actions through a systematic, collaborative mechanism
Presentation of Indicators to Green Team through Dashboards

Resident Survey Results (2022 - 2023)

- 81% of residents surveyed thought that tourism supports their local economy
- 35% of residents surveyed thought that tourism put pressure on the natural environment

- 81% of Residents agree that they have reasonable access to the natural and cultural sites in the destination
- 80% of Residents believe that tourism has a positive effect on the distinctiveness and local identity, culture and heritage in the destination
- 46% of Residents were not satisfied with tourism during the off season of winter

Impacts of Tourism to Resident’s Quality of Life

- Measures and Monitoring
  - It damages
  - It has no effect
  - It helps improve
  - It helps maintain

Impacts of Tourism to Resident’s Daily Life

- Noted Positive Impacts (%)
- Noted Negative Impacts (%)
  - No negative impacts: 29
  - Light pollution: 9
  - Noise pollution: 16
  - Traffic: 81
  - Drinking water availability: 4
  - Reduced water quality: 8
  - Less available housing: 33
  - Overcrowding: 22
  - Reduced bathing water quality: 12
  - Increased pressure on the environment: 10
  - Decreased access to cultural sites: 15

Presented by [Name]

[Date]

[Location]
Proposed green team process

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A.</th>
<th>B.</th>
<th>C.</th>
<th>D.</th>
<th>E.</th>
<th>F.</th>
<th>G.</th>
<th>H.</th>
<th>I.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• What has been completed/already actioned against?</td>
<td>• What is the corresponding Policy?</td>
<td>• Green Team Risk Register Identifying indicator/issue in terms of importance to address (From 1-5. 1=low priority, 5=highest urgency)</td>
<td>• Resulting Actions Actions created as a team based on possible solutions and identified targets</td>
<td>• Responsibility Decided upon responsibilities and resources</td>
<td>• Timeline Decided upon responsibilities and resources</td>
<td>• Green Team Response to Public</td>
<td>• Carry out actions as identified</td>
<td>• Repeat process Data gathering, longitudinal analysis to identify positive trends or areas of concern</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Processed Risk Register/ action prioritisation
adapted by the observatory from the Earth Check’s © Destination’s Risk Register

Risk Assessment

- Identify Aspects
- Determine Impacts
- Identify current controls
- Evaluate Risk

Consultation with Key Stakeholders

Review Annually
Proposed Risk Register/ action prioritisation
adapted by the observatory from the Earth Check’s Destination © Risk Register

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Likelihood</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Severity Key:
- Severe: >80
- Extreme: >45
- High: >25
- Medium: >11
- Low: <10

Green Team Assessment (adaptation)
# Proposed Risk Register/ action prioritisation
adapted by the observatory from the Earth Check’s Destination © Risk Register

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Date/Indicator</th>
<th>Result</th>
<th>Number of concerns</th>
<th>Number of concerns expressed as a percentage (%)</th>
<th>A. What has been completed/ already actioned against?</th>
<th>B. Corresponding Policy (e.g., Water Framework Directive EU Green Deal)</th>
<th>C. Green Team Considered Risk/ Importance to address</th>
<th>D. Resulting Actions (e.g., solutions, budgets)</th>
<th>E. Responsibility</th>
<th>F. Timeline</th>
<th>G. Green Team Respons e to public</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>This will allow us as a team to present double counting in terms of prioritizing actions.</td>
<td>(Score from 1-5)</td>
<td>Contribute if removal applicable to you in a number</td>
<td>1-low priority, 2-medium priority, 3-high priority, 4-very high priority, 5-highest urgency</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Resident Indicators

1. Resident belief that they have sufficient access to heritage/natural sites 80%
2. Percentage of residents that are satisfied with the impact of tourism on destination identity 80%
3. Residents’ satisfaction involvement in planning and management for tourism 25%
4. Percentage of residents that are satisfied with the kind of effect tourism has on the quality of life in Clare 75%
Using the risk register/action prioritisation mechanisms to support:

- sustainable destination strategies and

- policy instruments
Integration with policy instruments

Requested to submit to the Heritage Plan 2023-2029, using indicators and Green team assessment
Integration with policy instruments

Requested to submit to the Draft Climate Action Plan using indicators and Green Team assessment
Supporting the Destination Tourism Strategy

Using Destination Certification and indicators to quantify
Supporting Destination Tourism Strategies

Using Destination Certification and indicators to quantify and frame sustainability actions

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>STRATEGIC PRIORITIES</th>
<th>WHO IS INVOLVED</th>
<th>TIMING</th>
<th>PERFORMANCE INDICATORS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Guiding our Journey</td>
<td>County Clare Council</td>
<td>Immediate</td>
<td>• Completion of initial Destination Recovery and Strategy Action Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vibrant New Future in</td>
<td>Community tourism groups</td>
<td>Immediate</td>
<td>• Functioning county-wide Tourism Advisory Forum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>County Clare Tourism Strategy</td>
<td>Businesses</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Formalised county-wide commitment to the principles of sustainability in place (KPI)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2023</td>
<td>Industry</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Participation in new engagement practices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Relevant awards and certification (KPI)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Identification of sustainability metrics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Internal council tourism resources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Cross-departmental dialogue mechanisms in place</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Industry sentiment index (KPI)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Resident sentiment index (KPI)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Implementation of a ten-year strategy requires a series of shorter-term actions.
- Develop the first action plan mapping out a Covid-19 recovery plan.
- Establish a formalised county-wide commitment to sustainability.
- Explore opportunities for global recognition as a sustainable destination.
- Continue to support and strengthen the Global Geopark as a model.
- Reassess internal county council resources in relation to tourism.
Thank you for your support in our observatory

Contacts:
Fiona.mckenna@atu.ie
James.Hanrahan@atu.ie